|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Company | Clause | Comment | Rapp Response |
| Apple | 5.x.1.2 | Even RRC CR is still not finalized, the egress RLC channel determination need to be described for e2e SL-SRB. There could be two cases:   1. Use default configuration: PC5 Relay RLC channel (LCID = 55), we need a name for this channel. For example, SL-U2U-RLC; 2. Use non-default PC5 relay RLC channel configured in PC5-RRC procedure.   For me, the case 2 is an optimization, and there is no such support in the current RRC CR. I suggest the SRAP rapporteur to at least implement the first case instead of waiting. | Thanks, 1st case is implemented in the updated version |
| Apple | 5.x.3.2 | Same comment as above. | Thanks, 1st case is implemented in the updated version |
| Apple | 6.3.3 | In U2U Relay case, this field carries information to identify end-to-end PC5 radio bearer for U2U Remote UE. We need to emphasize this is an end-to-end PC5 bearer for U2U remote UE | Added, thanks |
| Apple | 6.3.3 | Typo “det” in for SL-DRBs, the value is det to the 5 LSBs of *slrb-PC5-ConfigIndex*. | Thanks, corrected |
| Apple | 6.3.3 | the value is det to the 5 LSBs of *slrb-PC5-ConfigIndex* used in end-to-end SL DRB configuration procedure as specified in TS 38.331 [3] | Added, thanks |
| Huawei, HiSilicon | 5.x.1  5.x.1.1 | According to 6.3.2, we understand there are two UE ID fields, one for source, the other for destination, so in the following description, it should be the UE ID fields.  5.x.1  …  Upon receiving an SRAP SDU from upper layer, the transmitting part of the SRAP entity on the PC5 interface shall:  - Determine the UE ID field and BEARER ID field in accordance with clause 5.x.1.1;  - Construct an SRAP Data PDU with SRAP header, where the UE ID field and BEARER ID field are set to the determined values, in accordance with clause 6.2.2;  - Determine the egress RLC channel in accordance with clause 5.x.1.2;  - Submit this SRAP Data PDU to the determined egress PC5 Relay RLC channel.  5.x.1.1 UE ID field and BEARER ID field determination | Added, thanks |
| Huawei, HiSilicon | 5.x.1.2，  5.x.3.2 | For the point raised by Apple about E2E SRB routing, we also agree case 1 is sufficient and can be implemented already. | Implemented in the updated version. |
| ZTE | 3.1 | **Egress RLC channel:** a RLC channel on which a packet is transmitted by a U2N Relay UE, a U2N Remote UE or a network node.  **Egress link**: a radio link on which a packet is transmitted by a U2N Relay UE, a U2N Remote UE or a network node.  Also used by U2U relay/remote UE? | Thanks, added |
| ZTE | 4.5 | The configuration of the SRAP entity for U2U Remote UE includes:  - Mapping from a radio bearer identified by BEARER ID field to egress PC5 Relay RLC channel;  - The local identities.  To identify a radio bearer, bearer ID is not enough, UE IDs of the remote UE pair is needed. In addition, suggest to add “sidelink” before “radio bearer”. | Thanks, “sidelink” is added before radio bearer.  For how to identify a radio bearer, agree with the intention of the comment, and similar wording of the configuration of U2U Relay UE is added to clarify. |
| ZTE | 5.x.1.1 | - Determine the BEARER ID field for SL-SRBs as the fixed value (i.e., set 0/1/2/3 for SL-SRB0/1/2/3 respectively) or for SL-DRBs as the 5 LSBs of *slrb-PC5-ConfigIndex*.  Suggest to add RRC reference, “, configured as specified in TS 38.331 [3])” | Thanks, added |
| ZTE | 5.x.3.1 | For a U2U SRAP Data PDU to be transmitted, SRAP entity shall:  - Determine the egress link on PC5 interface towards the peer U2U remote UE based on the UE ID pair in the U2U SRAP Data PDU.   1. Somewhere “U2U” is added before SRAP Data PDU/SRAP SDU, somewhere is not, better to align. 2. “UE ID pair”, it would be more clearer to say UE ID fields in the SRAP header of the SRAP Data PDU. | OK, updated |
| Nokia | 5.x.1 | Editorial: there are hanging paragraphs before 5.x.1.1. A new “5.x.1.1 General” should be introduced just after 5.x.1, and the rest of the subclauses should be renumbered. | Thanks, I’m not sure I fully get the point of this comment, some further clarification would be helpful. And the current structure is just same as R17, which I thought would be fine for now (we can further update in maintenance if needed)  [Rapp2] Thanks for the offline explanation, updated |
| Nokia | 5.x.3 | Editorial: same issue as above: there are hanging paragraphs before 5.x.3.1. A new “5.x.3.1 General” should be introduced just after 5.x.3, and the rest of the subclauses should be renumbered. | Please see above reply |
| Nokia | 5.4 | The error handling for some U2U cases is missing:   * In the U2U Remote UE: if there is no entry in SRAP configuration from the network as specified in TS 38.331 [3], whose bearer ID matches the SRB identity or DRB identity of the SRAP Data PDU * In the U2U Relay UE: If there is no entry in SRAP configuration from the network as specified in TS 38.331 [3], whose bearer ID matches the SRB identity or DRB identity of the SRAP Data PDU | Thanks, agree that the error handling for some cases is missing, and as explained, since the detailed cases are not discussed (although we feel it is quite straightforward, but would be safer for companies to check each case), the corresponding part is to be added in maintenance based on conclusions. |
| Nokia | 6.3.2 | Rewording proposal for the last added sentence:  In U2U Relay case, there are two UE ID fields: one for local identity of each U2U Remote UEs | OK, updated |
| Nokia | 6.3.3 | Editorial: separate sentence would make the text clearer (see yellow highlight with track changes below):  In U2U Relay case, this field carries information to identify end-to-end PC5 radio bearer for U2U Remote UE. For SL-SRBs, the value is set to 0/1/2/3 for SL-SRB 0/1/2/3 respectively. For SL-DRBs, the value is set to the 5 LSBs of slrb-PC5-ConfigIndex used in end-to-end SL DRB configuration procedure as specified in TS 38.331 [3]. | OK, updated |
| Apple | 5.x.1.2 | To align with existing text in 38.351, suggest to change as below  For a U2U SRAP Data PDU to be transmitted, the SRAP entity shall:  - If the U2U SRAP Data PDU is for SRB (i.e., the BEARER ID field is 0/1/2/3):  - Determine the egress PC5 Relay RLC channel in the determined egress link towards the U2U relay UE corresponding to *logicalChannelIdentity* for *SL-U2U-RLC* as specified in TS 38.33 [3] ~~for the determined egress link~~. | OK, updated |
| Apple | 5.x.1.2 | Else if the SRAP Data is for DRB, and if there is an entry in SRAP configuration from the network as specified in TS 38.331 [3], whose bearer IDmatches the DRB identityof the U2U SRAP Data PDU:  - Determine the egress PC5 Relay RLC channel corresponding to RLC channel ID configured for the concerned bearer ID as specified in TS 38.331 [3] for the determined egress link.  The problem with the highlighted part is that this only work for RRC\_CONNECTED remote UE because there is no *sl-SRAP-ConfigU2U* in SIB12 or Preconfiguration. Then, remote UE in IDLE/INACTIVE/OOC will fail to execute this procedure. So, the DRB part need to be rephrased as below (if there is no time to sort out all different cases before the deadline):  Else (i.e., for DRB):   * Determine the egress PC5 Relay RLC channel in the determined egress link towards the U2U relay UE according to related configuration as specified in TS 38.331 [3]. | OK with the suggestion |
| Apple | 5.x.3.2 | Similar comment as above two comments in 5.x.1.2 | OK with the suggestion |
|  |  |  |  |