|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Company | Clause | Comment | Rapp Response |
| Lenovo | 6.3.1 | For the field description for frequency information, “In this release” has ambiguity after introducing new IE ***sl-FreqInfoListSizeExt*** and suggest to remove the wording***sl-FreqInfoList, sl-FreqInfoListSizeExt***This field indicates the NR sidelink communication/discovery configuration on some carrier frequency (ies). ~~In this release,~~ Only one entry can be configured in the *sl-FreqInfoList*. | But I thought it is also true that even in Rel-18, the legacy IE (*sl-FreqInfoList*), would still have one entry?By removing the “in this release”, it seems to say it is applicable to all releases (even in the future), which seems not rigorous either?Lenovo: True. agree with Rapp not removing “in this release” |
| Lenovo | 5.2.2.4.13 | New added IE *sl-FreqInfoListSizeExt* and *sl-RLC-BearerConfigListSizeExt* are defined in SIB12 but not in *sl-ConfigCommonNR*. Needs to be aligned with 6.3.12> if *sl-FreqInfoList*/*sl-FreqInfoListSizeExt* is included in *sl-ConfigCommonNR*:…2> if *sl-RadioBearerConfigList* or *sl-RLC-BearerConfigList*/*sl-RLC-BearerConfigListSizeExt* is included in *sl-ConfigCommonNR*: | SL-ConfigCommonNR-r16 Is not extendable, so cannot be used.But true there is mis-match with procedural text, will correct the procedural text in the next iteration. |
| Lenovo | 6.3.5 and 5.8.9.1a.5.1 | Additional RLC configuration for SRB/SCCH is directly specified, so we understand there not need RLC configuration index for SRB RLC configuration. I guess the purpose to include this index for SRB is for unified release condition/operation of additional RLC bearer for both DRB and SRB? **6.3.5**SL-RLC-BearerConfig-r18 ::= CHOICE { srb SEQUENCE { sl-SRB-IdentityWithDuplication INTEGER (1..3), sL-RLC-BearerConfigIndex-r16 SL-RLC-BearerConfigIndex-r18, ... }, drb SEQUENCE { slrb-PC5-ConfigIndex-r18 SLRB-PC5-ConfigIndex-r16, sL-RLC-BearerConfigIndex-r16 SL-RLC-BearerConfigIndex-r18, sl-RLC-ConfigPC5-r18 SL-RLC-ConfigPC5-r16 OPTIONAL, -- Need M sl-MAC-LogicalChannelConfigPC5-r18 SL-LogicalChannelConfigPC5-r16 OPTIONAL, -- Need M ... }} **5.8.9.1a.5.1**1> for unicast, if *SL-RLC-BearerConfigIndex* (if any) of the sidelink DRB or SRB isincluded in *sl-RLC-BearerToReleaseList*/*sl-RLC-BearerToAddModListSizeExt* in *RRCReconfigurationSidelink*; | Exactly, the RLC bearer index for SRB is only used for a unified release operation.Lenovo: Thanks and no further comments. |
| Lenovo | 5.8.9.1.1 | Since following two sentences are basically same, seems they can be combined for concise text. No strong view though- the addition of sidelink carrier associated with the peer UE, as specified in clause 5.8.9.1b.2;- the modification of sidelink carrier associated with the peer UE, as specified in clause 5.8.9.1b.2;=> - the addition or modification of sidelink carrier associated with the peer UE, as specified in clause 5.8.9.1b.2; | True, but also I notice that in the legacy text, they always split the addition case and modification case, so I also split the two. No strong view, let’s see if any other view from companies |
| Lenovo | 5.8.9.1a.6 | A typo3> configure the MAC entity with a logical channel associated with the sidelink RLC entity, as specified in clause 9.1.1.4. | Thx for catching it, will correct it in the next iteration |
| Lenovo | 5.8.9.1b.2 | Typo and rewording1> for unicast, after receiving the *RRCReconfigurationCompleteSidelink* message,2> for each *sl-Carrier-Id* value included in the *~~sl-CarrierToReleaseList~~ sl-CarrierToAddModList* that is not part of the current UE configuration (sidelink carrier addition):…1> for unicast, if the ~~sidelink carrier addition~~ added sidelink carrier was modified due to the reception of the *RRCReconfigurationSidelink* message; or1> for unicast, after receiving the *RRCReconfigurationCompleteSidelink* message,2> for each *sl-Carrier-Id* value included in the *~~sl-CarrierToReleaseList~~ sl-CarrierToAddModList* that is part of the current UE configuration (sidelink carrier modification):3> modify the sidelink carrier configuration in accordance with *sl-AbsoluteFrequencyPointA* and *sl-AbsoluteFrequencySSB*; | Thanks for catching it, will update it in the next release |
| Lenovo | 6.3.5 | The new added timer is for C-LBT cancellation, so suggest following update for the description of IE and also the name of timer:***sl-LBT-FailureRecoveryConfig***Configures parameters used for detection and cancellation of consistent sidelink LBT failures for operation with shared spectrum channel access, as specified in TS 38.321 [3].– *SL-LBT-FailureRecoveryConfig*The IE *SL-LBT-FailureRecoveryConfig-r18* is used to configure the parameters used for detection and cancellation of sidelink consistent LBT failures for operation with shared spectrum channel access, as specified in TS 38.321 [3].***SL-LBT-FailureRecoveryConfig* information element**-- ASN1START-- TAG-SL-LBT-FAILURERECOVERYCONFIG-STARTSL-LBT-FailureRecoveryConfig-r18 ::= SEQUENCE { sl-lbt-FailureInstanceMaxCount-r18 ENUMERATED {n4, n8, n16, n32, n64, n128} OPTIONAL, -- Need Msl-lbt-FailureDetectionTimer-r18 ENUMERATED {ms10, ms20, ms40, ms80, ms160, ms320} OPTIONAL, -- Need Msl-LBT-~~Recovery~~CancellationTimer-r18 ENUMERATED {ms10, ms20, ms40, ms80, ms160, ms320} OPTIONAL, -- Need M...}-- TAG-SL-LBT-FAILURERECOVERYCONFIG-STOP-- ASN1STOP | For the naming of the timer, it is to align with 321 running-CR. For the other changes, they are fine for me, thanks!Lenovo: Thanks for the explanation. Still think the name is not so precise but understand the alignment. |
| Xiaomi | 5.8.6.2 | The UE shall for frequency(ies) which have been selected for NR sidelink communication as specified in TS 38.321 [3]:1> if [*syncFreqList*] is included in *RRCReconfiguration* or in *SIB12*, and includes at least one of the concerned frequency(ies)2> if the concerned frequency(ies) are included in *sl-FreqInfoToAddModList/sl-FreqInfoToAddModListExt* in *sl-ConfigDedicatedNR* within *RRCReconfiguration* message or includedin *sl-ConfigCommonNR* within *SIB12*, and *sl-SyncPriority* is configured for the concerned frequency and set to *gnbEnb*:The condition is not needed since the selected frequency must belongs to the NW configured frequency? |  |
| Xiaomi | 5.8.9.1  | The purpose of PC5-RRC also includes to indicate the PDCP duplication configuration of the SRB and DRB.  |  |
| Xiaomi | 5.8.9.1.2 | The corresponding behavior to add/release the carrier frequency is missing |  |
| Xiaomi | 5.8.9.1.3 | 1> if the *RRCReconfigurationSidelink* includes the *sl-CarrierToReleaseList*:2> for each entryvalue included in the *sl-CarrierToReleaseList* that is part of the current UE sidelink configuration;3> perform the additional sidelink RLC bearer release procedure, according to clause 5.8.9.1a.5;1> if the *RRCReconfigurationSidelink* includes the *sl-CarrierToAddModList*2> for each *sl-Carrier-Id* value included in the *sl-CarrierToAddModList* that is not part of the current UE sidelink configuration:3> perform the additional sidelink RLC bearer addition procedure, according to clause 5.8.9.1a.6;2> for each *sl-Carrier-Id* value included in the *sl-CarrierToAddModList* that is part of the current UE sidelink configuration:3> perform the additional sidelink RLC bearer modification procedure, according to clause 5.8.9.1a.6;Not correct should be carrier release/add/modification procedure.  |  |
| Xiaomi | 5.8.9.1a.1 | Since there is separate section to release the additinoal bearer, “the associated RLC entity(ies) (i.e., including the additional sidelink RLC bearer if applicable) for” is not needed in this section? |  |
| Xiaomi | 5.8.9.1a.5.2 | 1> for unicast, after receiving the *RRCReconfigurationCompleteSidelink* message, if the additional sidelink RLC bearer release was triggered due to the configuration received within the *SIB12*, *SidelinkPreconfigNR* or indicated by upper layers:2> for each *SL-RLC-BearerConfigIndex* included in transmitted *sl-RLC-BearerToReleaseList*/*sl-RLC-BearerToAddModListSizeExt* that is part of the current UE sidelink configuration:3> release the additional sidelink RLC bearer for NR sidelink communication associated with the *SL-RLC-BearerConfigIndex*;To align with section 5.9.1a.1, 1> for unicast, after receiving the *RRCReconfigurationCompleteSidelink* message, if the additional sidelink RLC bearer release was triggered due to the configuration received within the *SIB12*, *SidelinkPreconfigNR* or indicated by upper layers:2> release the RLC entity and the corresponding logical channel for NR sidelink communication associated with the additional sidelink RLC bearer; |  |
| Xiaomi | 5.8.9.1a.6.1 | There is no agreement that TX profile is associated per QoS flow, suggest to have editors’ note on this point |  |
| Xiaomi | 5.8.9.1a.6.2 | 1> for unicast, after receiving the *RRCReconfigurationCompleteSidelink* message, if the additional Sidelink RLC bearer addition was triggered due to the configuration received within the *sl-ConfigDedicatedNR,* *SIB12*, *SidelinkPreconfigNR* or indicated by upper layers:It should be up to TX UE implementation to enable PDCP duplication for SRB1/2/3, why this is related to the configuration received from NW?  |  |
| Xiaomi | 5.8.9.1a.6.2 | 2> else (i.e., if this procedure was for Sidelink SRB):3> configure the MAC entity with a logical channel associated with the sidelink RLC entity, s specified in clause 9.1.1.4.Typo as specified in … |  |
| Xiaomi | 5.8.9.1b.2 | 2> for each *sl-Carrier-Id* value included in the *sl-CarrierToReleaseList* that is not part of the current UE configuration (sidelink carrier addition):3> add the sidelink carrier, corresponding to the *sl-Carrier-Id*, in accordance with the *sl-AbsoluteFrequencyPointA* and *sl-AbsoluteFrequencySSB*;1> for unicast, after receiving the *RRCReconfigurationCompleteSidelink* message,2> for each *sl-Carrier-Id* value included in the *sl-CarrierToReleaseList* that is not part of the current UE configuration (sidelink carrier addition):3> add the sidelink carrier, corresponding to the *sl-Carrier-Id*, in accordance with the *sl-AbsoluteFrequencyPointA* and *sl-AbsoluteFrequencySSB*;Typo should be add/modify list |  |
| Xiaomi | 6.2.2 | ***sl-TxInterestedFreqList***Each entry of this field indicates the index of frequency on which the UE is interested to transmit NR sidelink communication, for each destination (within *SL-TxResourceReq-r16*) and for each QoS flow (within *SL-TxResourceReq-v1700*). The value 1 corresponds to the frequency of first entry in *sl-FreqInfoList* broadcast in *SIB12*, the value 2 corresponds to the frequency of first entry in *sl-FreqInfoList broadcast* in *SIB12*, the value 3 corresponds to the frequency of second entry in *sl-FreqInfoListSizeExt* broadcast in *SIB12* and so on.Should be ***sl-FreqInfoListSizeExt*** |  |
| Xiaomi | 6.3.5 | FD of sl-LBT-RecoveryTimer missing |  |
| Xiaomi | 6.3.5 |  srb SEQUENCE { sl-SRB-IdentityWithDuplication INTEGER (1..3), sL-RLC-BearerConfigIndex-r16 SL-RLC-BearerConfigIndex-r18, ...*Is this necessary for SRB?* |  |
| Xiaomi | 6.3.5 | Not correct to place here?  |  |
| Xiaomi | 6.3.5 | C:\Users\xm\AppData\Local\Temp\WeChat Files\dc643e586455a032b0698f350a94105.pngIs it a correct handling to include a r16 parameter in the r18 IE? Also the SL-RLC-BearerConfigIndex-r18 should be v18xy?RRCReconfigurationSidelink-v18xy-IEs ::= SEQUENCE {sl-CarrierToAddModList-r18 SEQUENCE (SIZE (1..maxNrofFreqSL-1-r18)) OF SL-CarrierConfig-r18 OPTIONAL, -- Need N sl-CarrierToReleaseList-r18 SEQUENCE (SIZE (1..maxNrofFreqSL-1-r18)) OF SL-CarrierId-r18 OPTIONAL, -- Need N sl-RLC-BearerToAddModList-r18 SEQUENCE (SIZE(1..maxNrofSLRB-r16)) OF SL-RLC-BearerConfig-r18 OPTIONAL, -- Need N sl-RLC-BearerToReleaseList-r18 SEQUENCE (SIZE(1..maxNrofSLRB-r16)) OF SL-RLC-BearerConfigIndex-r18 OPTIONAL -- Need N}Similar comment as above should be v18xy |  |
| Xiaomi | 6.3.5 | *RRCReconfigurationSidelink*SL-RLC-BearerConfigIndex-r18 ::= INTEGER (1..maxSL-LCID-r16)With the above change is this parameter applied to any other place? If not, can be deleted? |  |
| NEC | 5.3.13.1a | For relay case, does the UE needs to check the following highlighted:1> if configured by upper layers to transmit NR sidelink discovery and related data is available for transmission:2> if the UE is configured by upper layers to transmit NR sidelink L2 U2N relay discovery messages and *sl-L2U2N-Relay* is included in *SIB12*; or2> if the UE is configured by upper layers to transmit NR sidelink L3 U2N relay discovery messages and *sl-L3U2N-RelayDiscovery* is included in *SIB12*; or2> if the UE is configured by upper layers to transmit NR sidelink non-relay discovery messages and *sl-NonRelayDiscovery* is included in *SIB12*:3> if the frequency on which the UE is configured to transmit NR sidelink discovery is included in *sl-FreqInfoList*/*sl-FreqInfoListSizeExt* within *SIB12* provided by the cell on which the UE camps; and if the valid version of *SIB12* does not include *sl-DiscTxPoolSelected* or *sl-TxPoolSelectedNormal* for the concerned frequency; |  |
| NEC | 5.8.3.2 | Is it possible that sl-FreqInfoListSizeExt and sl-ScheduledConfig configured towards UE at the same time? Since CA is only supported for mode 2 UE:2> if configured by upper layers to perform NR sidelink transmission on the frequency included in *sl-FreqInfoList*/*sl-FreqInfoListSizeExt* in *SIB12* of the PCell and *if sl-DRX-ConfigCommonGC-BC* is included in *SIB12-IEs* andif the UE is configured with *sl-ScheduledConfig*: |  |
| NEC | 5.8.5.2 | Can rapp clarify what the exact condition does the “else” branch mean? Also, for the blue highlighted, can rapp confirm there would be no case that [syncFreqList] is configured while [slss-TxMultiFreq] is not configured1> if out of coverage on the frequency used for NR sidelink communication/discovery, and the frequency used to transmit NR sidelink communication/discovery is included in *sl-FreqInfoToAddModList/sl-FreqInfoToAddModListExt* in *sl-ConfigDedicatedNR* within *RRCReconfiguration* message or includedin *sl-FreqInfoList*/*sl-FreqInfoListSizeExt* within *SIB12*; and has selected GNSS or the cell as synchronization reference as defined in 5.8.6.3:2> if [*syncFreqList*] is not included in *RRCReconfiguration* nor in *SIB12*; or2> if [*syncFreqList*] is included in *RRCReconfiguration* or in *SIB12*; and if none of the frequency(ies) selected as specified in TS 38.321 [3] is included in the [*syncFreqList*] or the concerned frequency is selected as the synchronisation carrier frequency in accordance with 5.8.6.2; or2> if [*syncFreqList*] and [*slss-TxMultiFreq*] are included in *RRCReconfiguration* or in *SIB12*; and if the concerned frequency has been selected for NR sidelink communication transmission as specified in TS 38.321 [3] and is included in [*syncFreqList*]; and if the UE has selected a frequency other than the concerned frequency as the synchronisation carrier frequency in accordance with 5.8.6.2; and if [*slss-TxDisabled*] corresponding to the concerned frequency is not configured in *RRCReconfiguration* or in *SIB12*:3> if in RRC\_CONNECTED; and if *networkControlledSyncTx* is configured and set to *on*; or3> if *networkControlledSyncTx* is not configured; and for the concerned frequency *syncTxThreshIC* is configured; and the RSRP measurement of the reference cell, selected as defined in 5.8.6.3, for NR sidelink communication/discovery transmission is below the value of *syncTxThreshIC*:4> transmit sidelink SSB on the frequency used for NR sidelink communication/discovery in accordance with 5.8.5.3 and TS 38.211 [16], including the transmission of SLSS as specified in 5.8.5.3 and transmission of *MasterInformationBlockSidelink* as specified in 5.8.9.4.3;1> else: |  |
| NEC | 5.8.9.1.3 | Related comment as Xiaomi mentioned, it should be carrier addition/modification/release procedure. Moreover, the correct referred section should be 5.8.9.1b.1 and 5.8.9.1b.21> if the *RRCReconfigurationSidelink* includes the *sl-CarrierToReleaseList*:2> for each entryvalue included in the *sl-CarrierToReleaseList* that is part of the current UE sidelink configuration;3> perform the additional sidelink RLC bearer release procedure, according to clause 5.8.9.1a.5;1> if the *RRCReconfigurationSidelink* includes the *sl-CarrierToAddModList*2> for each *sl-Carrier-Id* value included in the *sl-CarrierToAddModList* that is not part of the current UE sidelink configuration:3> perform the additional sidelink RLC bearer addition procedure, according to clause 5.8.9.1a.6;2> for each *sl-Carrier-Id* value included in the *sl-CarrierToAddModList* that is part of the current UE sidelink configuration:3> perform the additional sidelink RLC bearer modification procedure, according to clause 5.8.9.1a.6; |  |
| NEC | 5.8.9.1.10 | We understand this is for duplication, but duplication is not always activated, so prefer to have the following addition:1> release the additional sidelink RLC bearer of this destination, if configured, in according to clause 5.8.9.1a.5; |  |
| NEC | 5.8.9.1a.6 | Can rapp further clarify what does the highlighted trigger operation mean?1> for unicast, after receiving the *RRCReconfigurationCompleteSidelink* message, if the additional Sidelink RLC bearer addition was triggered due to the configuration received within the *sl-ConfigDedicatedNR,* *SIB12*, *SidelinkPreconfigNR* or indicated by upper layers: |  |